



## Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project Honduras

**Mission report No. 007** 

Joint Mission AFE-COHDEFOR – Independent Monitor

------

Monitoring transport of timber

| Vahialaa               | Cover (7) Maak vahialaa          |
|------------------------|----------------------------------|
| venicies:              | Seven (7) Mack vehicles          |
| Plate Nos.:            | AAA6536, AAF5628, PAH1839,       |
|                        | AAB2969, AAB3536, AAE1351,       |
|                        | AAA6862                          |
| Transport Permit Nos.: | J-143739, J-143743, J-143757,    |
|                        | J-143758, J-143759, J-143761,    |
|                        | J-143762                         |
| Companies:             | - Industrias e Inversiones Josué |
|                        | - Industria Forestal San Esteban |
| Location:              | San Esteban, Olancho             |

Mission date: 1 July 2005

Report date: 14 July 2005

#### 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As part of the independent monitoring activities, on 1 July 2005 a joint mission  $AFE-COHDEFOR^1$  – Independent Monitor carried out a control of the transport of timber, checking the documentation of seven trucks that were simultaneously carrying logs towards San Esteban, Olancho.

According to the transport permits presented, all the trucks were coming from the place known as Platanares I, a national forest, which lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 was auctioned at Public Auction no. BN-01-2005 and allocated to Mr. Fredy Najera after he presented the highest offer per cubic meter (for further information see Mission Report No. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*).

On the same day, the timber was unloaded from the trucks and logs were measured at the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera.

These activities were carried out as part of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*, currently being implemented in the country. There were no reported problems or obstacles for the development of the mission.

During this mission it was possible to see that two of the seven transport permits, no. J-143739 and J-143743, presented several irregularities:

- 1) On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005' (see Figure 1).
- 2) On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005 (see Figure 2).
- 3) In addition, both transport permits presented numbers that did not match the sequence of the other five transport permits, as should be the case given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005). In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).
- 4) The trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:
  - The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27 (see Figure 1).
  - The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743 (see Figure 2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> State Forest Administration – Honduran Corporation of Forest Development (*Administración Forestal del Estado – Corporación Hondureña de Desarrollo Forestal*).

5) These multiple irregularities clearly suggest the possibility of a fraudulent use of these two transport permits.

Considering these conclusions, the Independent Monitor recommends:

- 1) That AFE-COHDEFOR notifies Mr. Fredy Najera the anomalies found and issues the relevant official denunciation according to the relevant legislation.
- 2) Given that on a previous occasion some irregularities had been detected in the harvesting of national forest lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 (see Mission Report no. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*) and that in this occasion it was possible to verify other irregularities in the transport of timber from this lot, AFE-COHDEFOR should carry out a technical audit of the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera, which are receiving timber from this site.

### 2. RESOURCES USED

- 1 four-wheel drive
- 1 photo camera
- 1 GPS
- 1 tape measure

### 3. COMPOSITION OF THE MISSION

- Mr. Santiago Ramírez, Head of San Esteban UEP<sup>2</sup>, AFE-COHDEFOR
- Mr. Fausto Mejía Zelaya, Independent Forest Monitor Team, CONADEH<sup>3</sup>
- Mr. Filippo Del Gatto, Independent Forest Monitor Team, Global Witness

### 4. CONSTRAINTS

There were no problems or obstacles during the implementation of this mission.

### 5. RESULTS OF THE MISSION

### 5.1 Summary of the mission

As part of the independent monitoring activities, on 1 July 2005 a joint mission AFE-COHDEFOR – Independent Monitor carried out a control of the transport of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Projects Implementation Unit (*Unidad Ejecutora de Proyectos*).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> National Commission for Human Rights (*Comisionado Nacional de Derechos Humanos*).

timber, checking the documentation of seven trucks that were simultaneously carrying logs towards San Esteban, Olancho.

According to the transport permits presented, all the trucks were coming from the place known as Platanares I, a national forest, which lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 was auctioned at Public Auction no. BN-01-2005 and allocated to Mr. Fredy Najera after he presented the highest offer per cubic meter (for further information see Mission Report No. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*).

On the same day, the timber was unloaded from the trucks and logs were measured at the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera.

### 5.2 Main findings

### a) Mistakes in the dates of the transport permits

All seven transport permits (no. J-143739, J-143743, J-143757, J-143758, J-143759, J-143761 y J-143762) presented irregularities in the dates, as the dates written were either 29 or 30 June 2005 instead of the right date, 1 July 2005. According to the drivers and to Mr. Fredy Najera, all these irregularities were caused by a mechanical problem with the truck with plate no. AAF5628, which prevented the other trucks to carry on and therefore caused a delay to all of them.

However, two transport permits presented irregularities that were more significant than the wrong dates:

- On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005' (see Figure 1).
- On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005 (see Figure 2).

### b) Lack of a sequence in the numbers of the transport permits

Another source of uncertainty was the fact that the numbers of the different transport permits did not follow a sequence as should be the case, given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005).

More specifically, it is worth mentioning that the first two transport permits (no. J-143739 y J-143743), that is, those presenting more irregularities in the dates, were also the ones not matching the sequence. In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).

# c) Discrepancies between the logs transported and the logs reported on the transport permits

Lastly, and through the unloading and measuring of the logs, it was possible to verify that the trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:

- The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27 (see Figure 1).
- The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743 (see Figure 2).

|                        |                           | <u> </u>                        |                                  |                 | ineg              | ulantie                                  | es nigi   | ingnu   | ed in red                             | •               |                                       |   |            |
|------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|--|---|---------|---------------------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------------------|---|------------|
|                        |                           | •                               |                                  | MINIS           |                   | ( <b>AFE</b> -                           | COHDI   | EFOR    |                                       | ESTAD           | 0                                     | **<br>::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::: |            |
|                        |                           |                                 |                                  |                 |                   |  |   |         | ANCHO                                 |                 |                                       |   |            |
|                        | -                         |                                 | - F2                             | ACTUR.          |                   |  |   |         | LO Y LA                               | BRADA           |                                       |   | -          |
|                        |                           |                                 |                                  |                 |                   | DATOS                                    | GENEI   | ALES    | F                                     | -ACT/U          | RA N१J                                | .143                                      | 739        |
| Unic                   | dad de N                  | Manejo                          | >                                |                 |                   |  |   |         | Comparti                              | miento N°       | -                                     |   |            |
| t                      |                           |                                 | SAN                              | EST             | E84N              | 1. A.                                    | andre.<br>Pressenter en la companya de la comp |         |                                       |                 | ,                                     |   |            |
| Sitio                  | >                         |                                 |                                  |                 | Mu                | inicipio                                 | <u></u>   |         | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | Depártamer      | nto                                   |   |            |
| l                      | P.                        | 247                             | ANARES                           | 1               |                   | SA                                       | NEST  | TEBA    | OLANC                                 | J C H0          |                                       |   |            |
| $\equiv$               |                           | ÌZ                              |                                  | TEN             | ENCIA             |  | /   |         | (                                     |                 |                                       |   |            |
| Naci                   | ional                     |                                 | * Privado                        |                 | Ejidal            |  | Indigena  |         |                                       |                 | -                                     |   |            |
| Cont                   | trato                     |                                 | Ver                              | nta Local       | ,                 | Contra                                   | tista   |         |                                       | Sub-Cont        | ratista                               |   |            |
| B                      | N-                        | 37                              | 8-2003                           |                 | /                 |  |   |         |                                       |                 | AR MAR                                | TINEZ                                     |            |
| Indu                   | istria Co                 | onsign                          | ataria                           |                 |                   | P  | RODUCT  | O A EL  | ABORAR                                |                 | Otros (                               | Indicar)                                  |            |
| IN                     | D-F                       | OR.                             | estal SAN B                      | STEBAN          | Aserrío           | ¥ Piy                                    | wood -  | Palillo | s F                                   | Postes          |                                       |   |            |
|                        |                           |                                 |                                  |                 |                   | N  | TADEP   | AEN     | ROLLC                                 | )               |                                       |   |            |
| N                      | ES                        | PECIE                           | Promedio de los                  | т`              | Pies Doyle        | 1 <del></del>                            |   | Nº      | Promedio de lo                        | s               | Pies Doyle                            |   |            |
| TRO                    |                           |                                 | Diametros en<br>Pulgadas de la   | LARGO<br>(Pies) | o Carga<br>Opción | 3<br>P                                   | 3<br>M  | TROZA   | Díametros en<br>Pulgadas de la        | LARGO<br>(Pies) | o Carga<br>Opción                     | 3<br>P                                    |            |
|                        |                           |                                 | Cara Menor                       | 28              | Aserradero        | 49                                       |   | 20      | Cara Menor                            | 28              | Aserradero                            | 18  | <u></u>    |
| 2                      |                           |                                 | 13                               | 28              |                   | 34                                       | -7  | 27      | 01                                    | 16              |                                       | Fil                                       |            |
| 3                      |                           |                                 | 16                               | 28-             | -                 | 49-                                      | -   | 28      |                                       | 1               |                                       | •   |            |
| 4                      |                           |                                 | 14                               | 28              |                   | 38                                       |   | 29      |                                       | 1               | (                                     |   |            |
| 5                      |                           |                                 | 15                               | 30              |                   | 47                                       |   | 30      |                                       | ·               | 4                                     |   | 1          |
| 6                      |                           |                                 | 13                               | -28             |                   | 34                                       |   | 31      |                                       |                 |                                       | f   |            |
| 7                      |                           |                                 | 10                               | 28              |                   | 22                                       |   | 32      |                                       | ì               |                                       |   |            |
| 8                      |                           |                                 | 10 -                             | 16              |                   | 11                                       |   | 33      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 10                     | -+-                       | -                               |                                  | 16              | ·                 | 9  |   | 35      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 11                     |                           |                                 | 10 -                             | 16              |                   | 11                                       | K   | 36      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 12                     |                           |                                 | 13                               | 28              |                   | 34                                       |   | 37      | 34                                    | 1               |                                       |   |            |
| 13                     | 3                         |                                 | ŝ                                | 28              |                   | 15                                       |   | 38      | 7/9                                   | 7               |                                       |   |            |
| 14                     | 4                         |                                 | 13                               | 28              | -                 | 34                                       |   | 39      | 120.                                  |                 |                                       | 1   |            |
| 15                     | 5                         | /                               | - 22                             | 24              |                   | 73                                       |   | 40      |                                       | 1               |                                       |   |            |
| 16                     |                           |                                 | 1.4                              | 28              |                   | 38                                       |   | 41      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 17                     |                           |                                 | 12                               | 28              |                   | 29                                       |   | 42      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 19                     |                           | _                               | 16                               | 28              |                   | 18                                       | <u>├</u>  | 43      | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |                 | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |   |            |
| 20                     |                           |                                 | 11                               | 28              |                   | 25                                       |   | 45      |                                       | 1               |                                       | <   |            |
| 21                     |                           |                                 | 10                               | 32              |                   | 26                                       | [   | 46      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 22                     |                           | -                               | 11 2                             | 20              |                   | 17                                       |   | 47      |                                       | 19 A.           |                                       |   |            |
| 23                     | J-                        |                                 | 7                                | 24              |                   | 10                                       |   | 48      |                                       | - ·             |                                       |   |            |
| 24                     |                           |                                 | 11                               | 22              |                   | 19                                       |   | 49      |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| 25                     |                           |                                 | 9                                | 16              |                   | 9  |   | 50      |                                       | <u>t-</u>       |                                       |   |            |
|                        | nbre Mo                   |                                 | EL. 227-3000 R.T.N. XEVKZG-A     |                 | Marca Venici      | រាត                                      | Placa Vehic   | ulo     |                                       | Nombre          |                                       |   |            |
|                        | EDEL SANDRES MACK         |                                 |                                  |                 |                   | A AA 6536 Despa-<br>chador RAFAEL MEDINA |   |         |                                       |                 |                                       |   |            |
| ( I mi                 | gar y Fe                  | iche                            | PLATAN                           | 47653           | -                 |  |   | Δ       | i Juou                                | STAL TO         | -                                     | WD/IEA                                    |            |
| 1.00                   | /                         | to 1                            | А                                | E JUN           | 10 /20            | 05                                       |   | pirma y |                                       |                 | St B                                  | CRA D                                     |            |
|                        | <i>. </i>                 | <u>.</u>                        | ro; Copia Verde:                 | Región Fore     | stal;             |  |   | Sello   |                                       | NTROL ST        | 1                                     | , ASD                                     | SE I       |
|                        | nal: Ase                  | errade                          |                                  |                 | ad do Manai       | 101                                      | SINCOLAL AN   | enter   | Aller                                 | METRICO 3       | 1Bar                                  | 19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (  | 21         |
| Copia<br>Copia         | nal: Ase<br>Rosa          | illa: Tr<br>da: Pa              | ansportista; Copi                | a Azul: Unida   |                   | (Same                                    | AT UE POPOLO  | Región  |                                       | 10.20           | 0                                     |   | 6//        |
| Copia<br>Copia         | nal: Ase                  | illa: Tr<br>da: Pa              | ansportista; Copis<br>2875       |                 |                   |  |   | brestal |                                       |                 | 131                                   | Sello Audif                               |            |
| Copia<br>Copia<br>TALC | A Rosad<br>ONAF<br>N* 206 | illa: Tr<br>da: Pr<br>RIO<br>S: | Esta Factura p<br>de la proceder | odrá ser re     | visada por        | (A                                       |   | netoni  | irios de OHE<br>ista presta la        |                 |                                       | uleran para                               | el control |
| Copia<br>Copia<br>TALC | A Rosad<br>ONAF<br>N* 206 | illa: Tr<br>da: Pr<br>RIO<br>S: | ansportista; Copis<br>2875       | odrá ser re     | visada por        |  |   | netoni  | arios de OHE<br>ista prestal la       |                 |                                       | uleran para                               | el control |

# Figure 1: Photocopy of transport permit no. J-143739, with the main irregularities highlighted in red.

|                          | Figure 2:  | Photoc              |   |                  |             |                                    | no. J-143<br>ed in red   |                | vith the                                      | main                                  |                          |
|--------------------------|--|---------------------|---|------------------|-------------|------------------------------------|--|----------------|---|---------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| T                        | ~  | ( /                 | (<br>REGION                                   | AFE<br>I FOR     | - COHDI     | EFOR<br>DE OLA                     | ANCHO  |                |   |                                       |                          |
|                          | F  | ACTUR               |   |                  | S GENEI     |                                    | LO Y LA  |                | RA Nº J                                       | - 143                                 | 743                      |
| Unidad de M              | lanejo   |                     | Tal   |                  |             |                                    |  | miento Nº      |   |                                       |                          |
| Sitio                    | Sa<br>aTanal   |                     | Mun   |                  | 1 m E       | o Ta                               | -<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>-<br>   | Departamen     | lana  | HD                                    | $\equiv$                 |
|                          | Y Privado  | TEN                 | ENCIA<br>Ejidal                               |                  | Indigena    |                                    | Usuario del  | Sitio          | 14114   | $\mu \omega$                          |                          |
| Contrato                 | y Ve   | inta Local          | Ejidai  | Contr            | atista      |                                    | ·  | Sub-Contr      | atista  | <u> </u>                              | -                        |
| Industrià Co             | +  |                     | Aserrío                                       | 1                | PRODUCT     |                                    |  | Postes         | Otros (                                       | Indicar)                              |                          |
| <u>Inve</u>              | .InVJos  | 46                  | Aserrio                                       |                  | MADER       |                                    | ROLLO  |                |   | ,                                     |                          |
| TROZA ESP                | ECIE Promedio de los<br>Díametros en<br>Pulgadas de la<br>Cara Menor | LARGO<br>(Pies)     | Pies Doyle<br>o Carga<br>Opción<br>Aserradero | 3<br>P           | 3<br>M      | TROZA                              | Promedio de la<br>Díametros en<br>Pulgadas de la<br>Cara Menor |                | Pies Doyle<br>o Carga<br>Opción<br>Aserradero | 3<br>P                                | 3<br>M                   |
| 2                        | 11   | 18                  |   | 23               |             | 26<br>27                           | 8  | 16             |   | /3                                    |                          |
| 3<br>4<br>5              | 10   | 30<br>32<br>28      |   | 51               |             | 28<br>29<br>30                     | 8  | 14             |   | 25                                    | 1                        |
| 6                        | 14   | 14                  |   | 17               |             | 31                                 | 15   | 28<br>28<br>28 |   | 43                                    |                          |
| 8<br>9                   | 9  | 36                  | -   | 60               |             | 33<br>34                           | 12<br>12   | 28<br>28       |   | 29                                    |                          |
| 10                       | 10   | 20                  |   | 14               |             | 35                                 | 10   | 28<br>26       |   | 22                                    |                          |
| 12<br>13<br>14           | 19<br>10<br>9  | 16                  |   | 25               |             | 37<br>28<br>39                     | 14   | 28             |   | 25                                    | ,                        |
| (15                      | 11   | 12                  | -   | 9                | 1           | 40                                 |  | -7             |   |                                       |                          |
| 17<br>18                 | 10   | 28<br>20            |   | 22               | e*-         | 42<br>43                           | 913  |                |   |                                       |                          |
| 19<br>20                 | 11   | 16 20               |   | 13               |             | 45                                 | 25.86  |                | (   |                                       |                          |
| 21<br>22<br>23           | 9<br>8<br>   | 1U<br>3 Z           |   | 8                | +           | 46<br>47<br>48                     |  |                |   |                                       |                          |
| 23<br>24<br>25           | 2 L<br>8<br>9  | 28<br>21<br>14      |   | 02<br>12<br>8    |             | 48<br>49<br>50                     |  | . (            |   |                                       |                          |
| Nombre Mot               | ORES TEL. 227.3000 R.T.N. JEYKZGA                                    |                     | Marca Vehículo                                |                  | Placa Vehíc | I                                  | 1  | Nombre         |   | <i>q</i>                              |                          |
| Lugary F.                | Tayoza   | nae                 | Hac   | *                | AAF         | 5/6 28                             | 2 Despa-<br>chador   | Firma          | u Q   | 10                                    |                          |
| Original: Aser           | radero; Copia Verde!   | Lun<br>Región Fores | io /z   | e of             |             | Eirma v<br>Sello<br>Autorizada     | A STREET   |                |   | Contraction of                        | 1000                     |
| Copia Rosada<br>TALONARI |  | Sontrol             |   | States of States |             | en la<br>Region<br>Porestal        | CONTRACTOR   |                |   | Sello Auditor                         |                          |
| ART. N* 206:             | Esta Factura p<br>de la proceder                                     |                     |   | Post and st      | debiendo di | Func <del>iona</del><br>transporti | sta prestal ta   | Colaboraci     | do así/lo re <del>q</del><br>n necesaria p    | <del>uieran para</del><br>para su-cum | el control<br>plimiento. |
|                          | /  |                     |   |                  |             |                                    |  | •              | $\mathbf{N}$                                  |                                       |                          |

#### 6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

During this mission, it was possible to verify that two of the seven transport permits, no. J-143739 and J-143743, presented several irregularities:

- 1) On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005'.
- 2) On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005
- 3) In addition, both transport permits presented numbers that did not match the sequence of the other five transport permits, as should be the case given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005). In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).
- 4) The trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:
  - The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27.
  - The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743.
- 5) These multiple irregularities clearly suggest the possibility of a fraudulent use of these two transport permits.

Considering these conclusions, the Independent Monitor recommends:

- 1) That AFE-COHDEFOR notifies Mr. Fredy Najera the anomalies found and issues the relevant official denunciation according to the relevant legislation.
- 2) Given that on a previous occasion some irregularities had been detected in the harvesting of national forest lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 (see Mission Report no. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*) and that in this occasion it was possible to verify other irregularities in the transport of timber from this lot, AFE-COHDEFOR should carry out a technical audit of the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera, which are receiving timber from this site.