



Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project Honduras

Mission report No. 007

Joint Mission AFE-COHDEFOR – Independent Monitor

Monitoring transport of timber

Vahialaa	Cover (7) Maak vahialaa
venicies:	Seven (7) Mack vehicles
Plate Nos.:	AAA6536, AAF5628, PAH1839,
	AAB2969, AAB3536, AAE1351,
	AAA6862
Transport Permit Nos.:	J-143739, J-143743, J-143757,
	J-143758, J-143759, J-143761,
	J-143762
Companies:	- Industrias e Inversiones Josué
	- Industria Forestal San Esteban
Location:	San Esteban, Olancho

Mission date: 1 July 2005

Report date: 14 July 2005

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

As part of the independent monitoring activities, on 1 July 2005 a joint mission $AFE-COHDEFOR^1$ – Independent Monitor carried out a control of the transport of timber, checking the documentation of seven trucks that were simultaneously carrying logs towards San Esteban, Olancho.

According to the transport permits presented, all the trucks were coming from the place known as Platanares I, a national forest, which lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 was auctioned at Public Auction no. BN-01-2005 and allocated to Mr. Fredy Najera after he presented the highest offer per cubic meter (for further information see Mission Report No. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*).

On the same day, the timber was unloaded from the trucks and logs were measured at the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera.

These activities were carried out as part of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*, currently being implemented in the country. There were no reported problems or obstacles for the development of the mission.

During this mission it was possible to see that two of the seven transport permits, no. J-143739 and J-143743, presented several irregularities:

- 1) On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005' (see Figure 1).
- 2) On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005 (see Figure 2).
- 3) In addition, both transport permits presented numbers that did not match the sequence of the other five transport permits, as should be the case given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005). In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).
- 4) The trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:
 - The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27 (see Figure 1).
 - The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743 (see Figure 2).

¹ State Forest Administration – Honduran Corporation of Forest Development (*Administración Forestal del Estado – Corporación Hondureña de Desarrollo Forestal*).

5) These multiple irregularities clearly suggest the possibility of a fraudulent use of these two transport permits.

Considering these conclusions, the Independent Monitor recommends:

- 1) That AFE-COHDEFOR notifies Mr. Fredy Najera the anomalies found and issues the relevant official denunciation according to the relevant legislation.
- 2) Given that on a previous occasion some irregularities had been detected in the harvesting of national forest lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 (see Mission Report no. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*) and that in this occasion it was possible to verify other irregularities in the transport of timber from this lot, AFE-COHDEFOR should carry out a technical audit of the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera, which are receiving timber from this site.

2. RESOURCES USED

- 1 four-wheel drive
- 1 photo camera
- 1 GPS
- 1 tape measure

3. COMPOSITION OF THE MISSION

- Mr. Santiago Ramírez, Head of San Esteban UEP², AFE-COHDEFOR
- Mr. Fausto Mejía Zelaya, Independent Forest Monitor Team, CONADEH³
- Mr. Filippo Del Gatto, Independent Forest Monitor Team, Global Witness

4. CONSTRAINTS

There were no problems or obstacles during the implementation of this mission.

5. RESULTS OF THE MISSION

5.1 Summary of the mission

As part of the independent monitoring activities, on 1 July 2005 a joint mission AFE-COHDEFOR – Independent Monitor carried out a control of the transport of

² Projects Implementation Unit (*Unidad Ejecutora de Proyectos*).

³ National Commission for Human Rights (*Comisionado Nacional de Derechos Humanos*).

timber, checking the documentation of seven trucks that were simultaneously carrying logs towards San Esteban, Olancho.

According to the transport permits presented, all the trucks were coming from the place known as Platanares I, a national forest, which lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 was auctioned at Public Auction no. BN-01-2005 and allocated to Mr. Fredy Najera after he presented the highest offer per cubic meter (for further information see Mission Report No. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*).

On the same day, the timber was unloaded from the trucks and logs were measured at the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera.

5.2 Main findings

a) Mistakes in the dates of the transport permits

All seven transport permits (no. J-143739, J-143743, J-143757, J-143758, J-143759, J-143761 y J-143762) presented irregularities in the dates, as the dates written were either 29 or 30 June 2005 instead of the right date, 1 July 2005. According to the drivers and to Mr. Fredy Najera, all these irregularities were caused by a mechanical problem with the truck with plate no. AAF5628, which prevented the other trucks to carry on and therefore caused a delay to all of them.

However, two transport permits presented irregularities that were more significant than the wrong dates:

- On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005' (see Figure 1).
- On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005 (see Figure 2).

b) Lack of a sequence in the numbers of the transport permits

Another source of uncertainty was the fact that the numbers of the different transport permits did not follow a sequence as should be the case, given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005).

More specifically, it is worth mentioning that the first two transport permits (no. J-143739 y J-143743), that is, those presenting more irregularities in the dates, were also the ones not matching the sequence. In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).

c) Discrepancies between the logs transported and the logs reported on the transport permits

Lastly, and through the unloading and measuring of the logs, it was possible to verify that the trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:

- The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27 (see Figure 1).
- The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743 (see Figure 2).

		<u> </u>			ineg	ulantie	es nigi	ingnu	ed in red	•			
		•		MINIS		(AFE -	COHDI	EFOR		ESTAD	0	** :::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::	
									ANCHO				
	-		- F2	ACTUR.					LO Y LA	BRADA			-
						DATOS	GENEI	ALES	F	-ACT/U	RA N१J	.143	739
Unic	dad de N	Manejo	>						Comparti	miento N°	-		
t			SAN	EST	E84N	1. A.	andre. Pressenter en la companya de la comp				,		
Sitio	>				Mu	inicipio	<u></u>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Depártamer	nto		
l	P.	247	ANARES	1		SA	NEST	TEBA	OLANC	J C H0			
\equiv		ÌZ		TEN	ENCIA		/		(
Naci	ional		* Privado		Ejidal		Indigena				-		
Cont	trato		Ver	nta Local	,	Contra	tista			Sub-Cont	ratista		
B	N-	37	8-2003		/						AR MAR	TINEZ	
Indu	istria Co	onsign	ataria			P	RODUCT	O A EL	ABORAR		Otros (Indicar)	
IN	D-F	OR.	estal SAN B	STEBAN	Aserrío	¥ Piy	wood -	Palillo	s F	Postes			
						N	TADEP	AEN	ROLLC)			
N	ES	PECIE	Promedio de los	т`	Pies Doyle	1 		Nº	Promedio de lo	s	Pies Doyle		
TRO			Diametros en Pulgadas de la	LARGO (Pies)	o Carga Opción	3 P	3 M	TROZA	Díametros en Pulgadas de la	LARGO (Pies)	o Carga Opción	3 P	
			Cara Menor	28	Aserradero	49		20	Cara Menor	28	Aserradero	18	<u></u>
2			13	28		34	-7	27	01	16		Fil	
3			16	28-	-	49-	-	28		1		•	
4			14	28		38		29		1	(
5			15	30		47		30		·	4		1
6			13	-28		34		31				f	
7			10	28		22		32		ì			
8			10 -	16		11		33					
10	-+-	-		16	·	9		35					
11			10 -	16		11	K	36					
12			13	28		34		37	34	1			
13	3		ŝ	28		15		38	7/9	7			
14	4		13	28	-	34		39	120.			1	
15	5	/	- 22	24		73		40		1			
16			1.4	28		38		41					
17			12	28		29		42					
19		_	16	28		18	<u>├</u>	43	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
20			11	28		25		45		1		<	
21			10	32		26	[46					
22		-	11 2	20		17		47		19 A.			
23	J-		7	24		10		48		- ·			
24			11	22		19		49					
25			9	16		9		50		<u>t-</u>			
	nbre Mo		EL. 227-3000 R.T.N. XEVKZG-A		Marca Venici	រាត	Placa Vehic	ulo		Nombre			
	EDEL SANDRES MACK					A AA 6536 Despa- chador RAFAEL MEDINA							
(I mi	gar y Fe	iche	PLATAN	47653	-			Δ	i Juou	STAL TO	-	WD/IEA	
1.00	/	to 1	А	E JUN	10 /20	05		pirma y			St B	CRA D	
	<i>. </i>	<u>.</u>	ro; Copia Verde:	Región Fore	stal;			Sello		NTROL ST	1	, ASD	SE I
	nal: Ase	errade			ad do Manai	101	SINCOLAL AN	enter	Aller	METRICO 3	1Bar	19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (19 (21
Copia Copia	nal: Ase Rosa	illa: Tr da: Pa	ansportista; Copi	a Azul: Unida		(Same	AT UE POPOLO	Región		10.20	0		6//
Copia Copia	nal: Ase	illa: Tr da: Pa	ansportista; Copis 2875					brestal			131	Sello Audif	
Copia Copia TALC	A Rosad ONAF N* 206	illa: Tr da: Pr RIO S:	Esta Factura p de la proceder	odrá ser re	visada por	(A		netoni	irios de OHE ista presta la			uleran para	el control
Copia Copia TALC	A Rosad ONAF N* 206	illa: Tr da: Pr RIO S:	ansportista; Copis 2875	odrá ser re	visada por			netoni	arios de OHE ista prestal la			uleran para	el control

Figure 1: Photocopy of transport permit no. J-143739, with the main irregularities highlighted in red.

	Figure 2:	Photoc					no. J-143 ed in red		vith the	main	
T	~	(/	(REGION	AFE I FOR	- COHDI	EFOR DE OLA	ANCHO				
	F	ACTUR			S GENEI		LO Y LA		RA Nº J	- 143	743
Unidad de M	lanejo		Tal					miento Nº			
Sitio	Sa aTanal		Mun		1 m E	o Ta	- - - - - - - - - - - - 	Departamen	lana	HD	\equiv
	Y Privado	TEN	ENCIA Ejidal		Indigena		Usuario del	Sitio	14114	$\mu \omega$	
Contrato	y Ve	inta Local	Ejidai	Contr	atista		·	Sub-Contr	atista	<u> </u>	-
Industrià Co	+		Aserrío	1	PRODUCT			Postes	Otros (Indicar)	
<u>Inve</u>	.InVJos	46	Aserrio		MADER		ROLLO			,	
TROZA ESP	ECIE Promedio de los Díametros en Pulgadas de la Cara Menor	LARGO (Pies)	Pies Doyle o Carga Opción Aserradero	3 P	3 M	TROZA	Promedio de la Díametros en Pulgadas de la Cara Menor		Pies Doyle o Carga Opción Aserradero	3 P	3 M
2	11	18		23		26 27	8	16		/3	
3 4 5	10	30 32 28		51		28 29 30	8	14		25	1
6	14	14		17		31	15	28 28 28		43	
8 9	9	36	-	60		33 34	12 12	28 28		29	
10	10	20		14		35	10	28 26		22	
12 13 14	19 10 9	16		25		37 28 39	14	28		25	,
(15	11	12	-	9	1	40		-7			
17 18	10	28 20		22	e*-	42 43	913				
19 20	11	16 20		13		45	25.86		(
21 22 23	9 8 	1U 3 Z		8	+	46 47 48					
23 24 25	2 L 8 9	28 21 14		02 12 8		48 49 50		. (
Nombre Mot	ORES TEL. 227.3000 R.T.N. JEYKZGA		Marca Vehículo		Placa Vehíc	I	1	Nombre		<i>q</i>	
Lugary F.	Tayoza	nae	Hac	*	AAF	5/6 28	2 Despa- chador	Firma	u Q	10	
Original: Aser	radero; Copia Verde!	Lun Región Fores	io /z	e of		Eirma v Sello Autorizada	A STREET			Contraction of	1000
Copia Rosada TALONARI		Sontrol		States of States		en la Region Porestal	CONTRACTOR			Sello Auditor	
ART. N* 206:	Esta Factura p de la proceder			Post and st	debiendo di	Func iona transporti	sta prestal ta	Colaboraci	do así/lo re q n necesaria p	uieran para para su-cum	el control plimiento.
	/							•	\mathbf{N}		

6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

During this mission, it was possible to verify that two of the seven transport permits, no. J-143739 and J-143743, presented several irregularities:

- 1) On the first transport permit (no. J-143739) it was obvious that the first part of the date, 'thirty' (*'treita'*, wrongly spelt) had been written with a different pen and writing than the second part of the date, 'June 2005'.
- 2) On the second transport permit (no. J-143743), the date was incomplete and did not indicate the day of June 2005
- 3) In addition, both transport permits presented numbers that did not match the sequence of the other five transport permits, as should be the case given that all trucks were coming from the same site and belonged to the same harvesting contract (no. BN-378-2005). In fact, these two transport permits belong to a different checkbook number (2875 instead of 2876).
- 4) The trucks carrying these two transport permits were carrying a number of logs that did not coincide with what the relevant transport permit specified:
 - The truck with plate no. AAA6536 had 23 logs, whereas transport permit no. J-143739 indicated it should have 27.
 - The truck with plate no. AAF5628 had 26 logs instead of the 37 written in transport permit no. J-143743.
- 5) These multiple irregularities clearly suggest the possibility of a fraudulent use of these two transport permits.

Considering these conclusions, the Independent Monitor recommends:

- 1) That AFE-COHDEFOR notifies Mr. Fredy Najera the anomalies found and issues the relevant official denunciation according to the relevant legislation.
- 2) Given that on a previous occasion some irregularities had been detected in the harvesting of national forest lot no. BN-J1-01-04-05 (see Mission Report no. 002 of the *Independent Forest Monitoring Pilot Project*) and that in this occasion it was possible to verify other irregularities in the transport of timber from this lot, AFE-COHDEFOR should carry out a technical audit of the sawmills 'Industrias e Inversiones Josué' and 'Industria Forestal San Esteban', both property of Mr. Fredy Najera, which are receiving timber from this site.